



Joe Nelson
Petersburg Municipal Power and Light
Superintendent
Petersburg, AK 99685

January 13, 2017

Subject: 350 KW Generator Bid Review

Joe,

This letter summarizes the bids received by PMLP, the review process and comments as well as a recommended lowest responsive bidder.

Bids

PMPL received a total of five responses to the RFP dated 12/5/16. See the below table:

| Vendor | Manufacturer | Price (each) | Lead time | Ranking |
|-------------------|--------------|--------------|------------|--------------|
| Pacific Power | MTU | \$97,612 | 12-14 wks | 1 |
| Frontier Power | Kohler | \$177,467 | 8-12 wks | Disqualified |
| Critical Power | Gillette | \$94,960 | 6 wks | Disqualified |
| Tacoma Diesel | Kohler | \$203,716 | 16-18 wks | 3 |
| Cummins Anchorage | Cummins | \$0 | n/a | Disqualified |
| NC Machinery | Caterpillar | \$115,131 | not stated | 2 |

Bid Review Summary and Recommendation

EPS and PMLP met by teleconference on 1/12/17 to discuss each reviewer's comments and discuss pros and cons of the proposal. The following is a summary of the meeting.

Pacific Power was the lowest responsive bidder. PMLP has had a good working relationship with Pacific Power in the past. Local service is available as well as technicians from Washington. The proposal provides an enclosure that will be well suited to the Petersburg environment, with no roof penetrations and a sloped roof. The electrical installation will be simplified due to the Pacific Power enclosure design which requires only a single station service connection. The MTU unit will have a Basler controller included. This controller is one that is familiar to PMLP and will meet the project requirements. The lead time for this new unit is reasonable. A clarification regarding the type of enclosure should be obtained prior to issuing a PO.

Frontier Power was eliminated due to not meeting the specification. They were also second highest in price.

Critical Power was eliminated due to not meeting the specification and RFP requirements completely.

Tacoma Diesel provided an acceptable proposal but was the highest bidder.

Cummins Anchorage did not turn in a bid.

NC Machinery provided an acceptable proposal. NC Machinery has provided technician support to PMLP in the past out of Juneau or other NC locations. The proposed unit has a different enclosure design and would require more electrical work to provide power to all necessary circuits. The lead time was not stated in the proposal and would be available upon an order being placed. While this unit would meet the needs of PMLP, NC was the second lowest bid.

EPS recommends the Pacific Power MTU unit to be purchased as the lowest responsive bidder. PMLP concurred with this recommendation during the bid review meeting.

If you have questions or require additional information, feel free to contact me at 907-523-3104.

Thank you,



William Brown-Farrell, PE, PMP
Electric Power Systems, Inc.

PETERSBURG MUNICIPAL POWER AND LIGHT
350KW STAND-BY GENERATOR PACKAGE - BID PROPOSALS

January, 2017

| SUPPLIER | BID | MANUFACTURER | ENGINE | GENERATOR | CONTROLS | DELIVERY | SERVICE CENTER | FUEL EFF. |
|---------------------------|---------------|--------------|------------|-----------|---------------|-------------|----------------|--------------------------------|
| Pacific Power Generation | \$ 97,612.00 | M.T.U. | MTU V-8 | Marathon | Basler 3000 | 12-14 weeks | ANCHORAGE, AK | 50%/75%/100% 16.3/21.7/26.5 |
| Frontier Power Generation | \$ 177,467.00 | Kohler | John Deere | Kohler | Kohler | 8-12 weeks | DELTA, BC | 19.83 |
| Critical Power Exchange | \$ 94,960.00 | Gillette | Volvo | Marathon | Deep Sea 7420 | 6 weeks | ANCHORAGE, AK | 19.33 |
| Tacoma Diesel & Equipment | \$ 203,716.00 | Kohler | John Deere | Kohler | DEC6000 | 16-18 weeks | TACOMA, WA | 20.90 |
| NC Power Systems | \$ 115,131.00 | CAT | CAT | CAT | CAT EMPC 4.2 | ? | JUNEAU, AK | 23.13 |

| EVALUATION | COMPLETE | QUAL./EXP. X2 | SERVICE CTR. X1.5 | PRICE X2 | FUEL EFF. X1 | SPARE PARTS | TOTAL | EXCEPTIONS |
|---------------------------|----------|------------------|----------------------|-------------|-----------------|-------------|-------|------------------------|
| Pacific Power Generation | | 10 | 6 | 8 | 2 | N/A | 26.00 | none |
| Frontier Power Generation | | 4 | 1.5 | 4 | 4 | N/A | 13.50 | not a new product |
| Critical Power Exchange | | 2 | 4.5 | 10 | 5 | N/A | 21.50 | not ISO 9001 certified |
| Tacoma Diesel & Equipment | | 6 | 3 | 2 | 3 | N/A | 14.00 | none |
| NC Power Systems | | 8 | 7.5 | 6 | 1 | N/A | 22.50 | No delivery time |

RATE 1-5, 5 = BEST